

Evaluation of the Effectiveness of the XII Pakistan Studies Sindh Textbook in  
Developing Civic Awareness among Students

Saima Khatoon

[azizaamur27@gmail.com](mailto:azizaamur27@gmail.com)

Lecturer, Pakistan Studies, GDGC Sheikh Zaid Centre, Karachi, Pakistan

Corresponding Author: Saima Khatoon [azizaamur27@gmail.com](mailto:azizaamur27@gmail.com)

Received: 03-02-2026

Revised: 15-02-2026

Accepted: 05-03-2026

Published: 22-03-2026

## ABSTRACT

*A primary objective of Pakistan Studies is civic awareness, which aims to give students the information, attitudes, and values required for responsible citizenship. Nevertheless, little research has been done on how well the XII Pakistan Studies Sindh textbook carries out this civic responsibility. The usefulness of the Sindh Textbook Board's XII Pakistan Studies textbook in fostering civic awareness in upper secondary students is analyzed through this qualitative content analysis. The study examines textbook chapters, exercises, end-of-unit questions, illustrations, and topics pertaining to democracy, the constitution, human rights, governance, national identity, and civic duty using an organized analytical (Civic Education Framework (Knowledge–Skills–Values Model) framework. The results show that although basic civic concepts are covered in the textbook, the presentation is mostly descriptive and lacks the interactive, analytical, and practical application assignments necessary to promote meaningful civic involvement. There are very few activities that encourage critical thinking, problem-solving, dialogue, and civic engagement. As a result, while the textbook teaches civic principles, it does not adequately build students' practical civic competencies. The study comes to the conclusion that the civic value of the textbook would be greatly increased by incorporating inquiry-based exercises, case studies, current civic issues, and participatory learning assignments. Policymakers, curriculum designers, and textbook authors are given suggestions to improve civic education at the higher level.*

**Keywords:** Civic Awareness, Pakistan Studies, Textbook Analysis, Citizenship Education

## INTRODUCTION

Education is essential in democratic societies for nurturing civic awareness, social ideals, and active participation in addition to teaching factual knowledge. Traditionally, the subject of Pakistan Studies has been seen in Pakistan as the main means of teaching children about national identity, constitutional knowledge, citizenship rights, and civic responsibilities. The textbook produced by the Sindh Textbook Board is formally anticipated to teach pupils in senior secondary school, notably in XII grade, about the constitution, state institutions, history, and national identity, as well as to prepare them for their duties as citizens (Taseer et al., 2023)..

Despite these elevated goals, there is increasing worry among civil society and educational scholars that textbooks—and the teaching methods based on them—may not be doing enough to promote real civic competence. A mixed methods study done in Punjab found that civic and political topics are given little attention in textbooks and curricula. Teachers indicated that classroom time spent on civic or political issues was only around 5%, and students seldom participated in active citizenship activities like debate, rights-based discussion, or community participation (Iqbal et al., 2024).

Similarly, content analysis of Social Studies textbooks at the primary level revealed a lack of civic education material: Grade IX book met only 42.96% of anticipated civic education standards, while Grade XII book reached 65.34%, a little increase but still insufficient (Taseer et al., 2020). This trend

increases concerns about the efficacy of higher-level textbooks, like the XII Pakistan Studies book, and points to systemic flaws in the integration of civic material from the elementary grades on.

In light of this context, it is imperative to analyze whether the Pakistan Studies textbook for the XII grade adequately promotes civic education. More precisely, does the textbook offer civic knowledge as well as pedagogical features that promote civic skills and values? Or is it mostly a repository of institutional data and descriptive history? Using a theoretical framework that views civic competence as a multidimensional construct (knowledge, skills, values), this study answers these questions using a systematic content analysis. In order to provide evidence-based assessment and recommendations for textbook changes and civic education policy, it does so.

## **LITERATURE REVIEW**

### **Civic Education: Knowledge, Skills, and Values**

Civic competency, according to civic education scholars, is not just the acquisition of information but rather a complex interaction between values, civic action, and knowledge. Understanding constitutions, rights, laws, institutions, history, and social identity are all part of civic knowledge. Analytical reasoning, critical thinking, participatory participation, argument, decision-making, collaboration, and problem-solving are all examples of civic skills. Attitudes like tolerance, social justice, and respect for diversity, human rights, empathy, and national responsibility are deep-rooted in civic values (Damiani & Fraillon, 2025).

Effective civic education must go beyond textbook narratives; it must include interactive, inquiry-based, and reflective instruction. Textbooks require doing more than just present facts; they should also have exercises that encourage pupils to interact with real-world challenges, conduct critical analysis, discuss contexts, and consider moral or ethical dilemmas. Comparative studies between nations have shown that civic education that incorporates these pedagogies promotes greater civic awareness, social responsibility, and democratic participation among students (Torres & Bosio, 2025).

### **Empirical research on textbooks used in civic education in Pakistan**

Empirical research on civic education in Pakistan using textbooks and curriculum highlights systematic deficiencies. The 2023 content analysis of Punjab's primary-level Social Studies textbooks indicated that they fell well short of expected civic education benchmarks. At the secondary level, a 2024 study analyzing the Pakistan Studies curriculum and textbooks reported that there was very little political education or active citizenship content; students were given little opportunity to interact with modern civic concerns or participate meaningfully in civic debate (Aslam, 2025).

Moreover, it was contended that institutional limitations, such as exam-driven pedagogy, a lack of teacher training for participatory civic instruction, and inadequate resources, impede the achievement of civic education goals by restricting youth civic participation and political understanding. Regional comparative research conducted outside of Pakistan demonstrates that textbooks frequently include moral and religious beliefs but do not always represent pluralistic, inclusive, or democratic viewpoints, particularly at the secondary and tertiary levels (Siow, J. 2025).

### **Theoretical Framework**

According to Quigley and Bahmueller, (1991) Civic Education Framework believes civic competency to be a comprehensive result influenced by three related factors. The first dimension, Civic Knowledge, covers a student's comprehension of the state's political and constitutional framework, including its laws, governmental institutions, civic rights and obligations, historical events, national identity, and key social systems. The second aspect, Civic Skills, focuses on the learners' capacity for critical thinking,

discussion, debate, collaboration with peers, problem-solving, and well-informed decision-making, all of which are indispensable for being an active and accountable citizen. Civic Values, the third dimension, emphasizes the significance of qualities and behaviours such as tolerance, respect for religious and cultural diversity, social justice, empathy, civic responsibility, and dedication to democratic principles.

All three dimensions are hoped to be covered in a thorough civics textbook using both its content and its pedagogy. This implies that the textbook need not only provide factual information but also contain case studies, reflective questions, debate and discussion prompts, inquiry-based activities, and exercises that reflect contemporary societal challenges. This kind of feature enables pupils to link theoretical concepts with real civic experiences. The coding categories used in this research were informed by the Civic Education Framework, which also guided the methodical examination of the XII Grade Pakistan Studies textbook, aiding in the evaluation of how well the book fostered civic knowledge, taught crucial skills, and promotes democratic principles among students.

## **METHODOLOGY**

### **Research design**

The qualitative content analysis method, which is useful for systematically analyzing textbooks to determine the presence (or absence) of civic education elements, was used in this study. Qualitative content analysis is a systematic research method used to interpret textual, visual, or audio data by identifying patterns, themes, and meanings through coding and categorization. It is commonly used in qualitative research to analyze interview transcripts, documents, and textbooks in order to understand underlying concepts and perspectives (Schreier, 2023).

### **Data Sources and Scope**

The most recent (2024–25) version of the XII-grade Pakistan Studies textbook, which was published by the Sindh Textbook Board, was the main data source. All of the textbook's chapters, sub-units, illustrations, maps, textual narratives, end-of-chapter questions, and any supplementary content were covered by the study.

### **Coding System**

Based on the Civic Education Framework, a coding scheme was formed with three primary categories, each having sub-codes: Skills, Knowledge, and Values.

- Sub-codes of knowledge: state institutions, geography and demographics, civic institutions, historical chronology, national identity and symbols, national history, citizen rights and obligations, governance structure, and constitutional history.
- Sub-codes for skills include: analytical questions (compare/contrast, evaluate), case studies, discussion prompts, group work, civic action projects (community service, social surveys), role plays or simulation tasks (e.g., mock parliament or elections), present-day issue analysis, problem-solving tasks, reflective writing or debates.
- Values sub-codes: awareness of human rights, tolerance, inclusion of minority viewpoints, social justice, respect for diversity, national unity, empathy, civic responsibility, respect for laws and institutions.

Each textual and task-based element was coded in accordance with its nature. The analysis included several readings: the first to map all content, the second to categorize according to sub-codes, and the

third to evaluate the level of engagement (i.e. if the activities were superficial evoke or more in-depth analytical/reflective). Where applicable, the existence or absence of representations of minorities, social concerns, or pluralistic viewpoints was also highlighted.

### **Trustworthiness and Reliability**

The coding was done independently by the key researcher and a second reviewer, who was a experienced social studies instructor, to improve reliability. Differences in coding were addressed by agreement, reference to the coding handbook, and conversation. Individual tasks, chapters, and issues were the units of analysis, which gave specificity and allowed for thorough coverage.

### **Limitations**

This research only includes textbook information and excludes classroom observations, teacher interviews, and student responses. As a result, the textbook's content, rather than the teaching or student responses, is reflected in the findings. The deficiencies found may be made better or worse by actual classroom practice. Future studies need empirically investigate the impact of these textbook characteristics (or lack thereof) on civic values, skills, and behaviour in the classroom.

## **FINDINGS**

### **Civic Knowledge: Extensive but Stagnant**

The textbook offers a thorough overview of civic literacy topics. Numerous chapters address constitutional history, covering historical milestones, constitutional reforms, fundamental rights, and the state's structural form. The state institutions—the executive, legislative, and judicial branches are listed, along with their functions, powers, and roles within the national governance structure. Included are federal ties, core tenets of citizenship, and citizens' rights provincial frameworks, and responsibilities. The history of Pakistan, from pre-Partition to independence, wars, political changes, and contemporary advancements, is enclosed in historical narratives. Themes of national identity are also covered, such as national symbols, cultural legacy, geography, demography, and state ideology.

Overall, the knowledge dimension has a wide breadth and scope, giving students a thorough understanding of the constitutional, institutional, historical, and identity-related dimensions. This fulfils the Civic Education Framework's knowledge sub codes. But this information is still mainly theoretical and unchanged. Without any context regarding their implementation, historical difficulties, or limitations, constitutional rights and institutional frameworks are shown as normative ideals. For instance, discussions of fundamental rights seldom address social and political concerns like minority rights, gender inequality, socioeconomic inequalities, or human rights abuses. Social discord, regional disparities, or dissenting viewpoints variety of experiences, are frequently understated in historical accounts, which lean to focus on victories and nationalist language. As a result, students learn formal knowledge but receive minute guidance in applying it to the actual world of civic and social affairs.

### **Civic Skills: Mostly Overlooked; Evaluation Relies on Memory**

The skills dimension indicated a major deficit. The majority of the end-of-chapter activities and questions ask students to remember things like listing rights, identifying institutions, memorizing dates, giving event summaries, and defining terms. The assignments are almost completely devoid of activities that need comparison, evaluation, critical thinking, discussion, role-playing, simulation, case study analysis, community-based work, or project work, and there are very few analytical questions.

There are no mock legislative discussions, no simulations of democratic processes (elections, parliamentary decision-making), no community polls or civic initiatives, and no tasks that encourage

students to connect textbook material to current social concerns. In fact, students are not given the chance to develop their skills in civic reasoning, decision-making, participatory citizenship, or problem-solving. Students are unable to turn knowledge into practical civic competence in the absence of assignments that need participation, which proposes that the textbook does not train civic skills.

### **Civic Values: Present in Narrative; Not Reinforced Through Pedagogical Design**

The textbook repeatedly applies nationalistic and patriotic stories. It promotes values like respect for state institutions, national unity, pride in national history, and allegiance to one's nation. These ideas are woven throughout the book's chapters in historical accounts, patriotic speeches, and closing remarks.

These community values, even if, are expressed symbolically and declaratively. There is no supporting educational framework, such as reflective questions, ethical or moral conflicts, or discussions of human rights, social justice, minority inclusion, empathy, or pluralism. Students are not required to consider their duties as citizens, social disparities, or the moral dilemmas that people come across.

Furthermore, social diversity is underrepresented; ethnic, religious, linguistic, gender-based diversity and minority perspectives are given little or no attention. The story is still focused on the state and monolithic. Thus, civic values are not internalized in a meaningful way; rather, they continue to be abstract ideals as divergent to real-world practices or critically analyzed principles.

### **Current Relevance and Civic Agency**

Relevance to contemporary social, political, economic, and worldwide concerns is required in modern civic education. The textbook being analyzed, though, makes little to no mention of modern challenges like human rights, social inequality, environmental issues, minority rights, gender concerns, governance crises, civic activism, or globalization. The course includes no case studies, no analysis of current national or international concerns, and no tasks that promote social involvement, community understanding, or civic action.

The lack of such material disconnects students' theoretical understanding from real-world civic engagement. The textbook's competence to promote civic agency, social responsibility, critical citizenship, or sustainable engagement with society's changing problems is significantly hampered by this disparity.

## **DISCUSSION**

### **Systemic Shortcomings in Civic Pedagogy and Textbook Design**

The findings indicated systemic weaknesses in civic pedagogy embedded within the textbook. While the knowledge dimension is thoroughly addressed, the pedagogical design neglects civic skills and civic values both essential components of holistic civic education. This pattern aligns with previous research showing that Pakistani textbooks often prioritize factual knowledge and historical narrative while ignoring participatory, critical, or value oriented competencies.

This configuration risks producing passive citizens who may know constitutional facts but lack capacity or inclination for civic participation, critical reflection, or social engagement. The absence of discussion, debate, and civic action tasks proposes that the textbook is designed more for rote learning and examination performance than for fostering democratic citizenship.

### **Implications for Citizenship, Social Cohesion, and Democratic Culture**

In a pluralistic and miscellaneous society like Pakistan characterized by ethnic, linguistic, religious, and regional diversity civic education must encourage tolerance, social justice awareness, respect for diversity, and inclusive citizenship. By failing to present multiple perspectives, avoiding minority experiences, and omitting discussion of social inequalities or human rights issues, the textbook challenges these aims. Students may internalize a narrow, state-centred perspective of national identity, which may unintentionally perpetuate social homogeneity and marginalization of minority voices.

Moreover, the lack of civic skills development like argue, critical thinking, decision-making, participatory understanding means that having knowledge does not transform into civic engagement. Without opportunities for action, students are doubtful to become active, socially aware citizens capable of contributing to democratic processes, civic discourse, or community development.

### **Need for Curriculum Reform and Pedagogical Innovation**

Focussing these findings, there is an urgent need for curriculum reforms and pedagogical innovation. Civic education needs not to be limited to textbooks with static narratives; rather, it demands participatory, inquiry-based, reflective, and contextual learning. Textbooks should be redesigned to include case studies, debates, discussion of contemporary social issues, community oriented assignments, simulations, and representation of social diversity.

Policy-level evaluations have also highlighted that institutional constraints (exam driven pedagogy, lack of teacher training, absence of resources) hamper effective civic education. To recognize civic education objectives, textbook reform must be complemented by teacher training, provision of resources, pedagogical flexibility, and perhaps inclusion of civic education as a standalone or integrated subject with dedicated instructional time.

### **CONCLUSION**

The XII-grade Pakistan Studies textbook (Sindh Textbook Board) underwent content analysis in this study. The results showed a strong civic knowledge base but significant pedagogical deficiencies in promoting civic values and skills. Even if students can remember history, constitutional facts, and institutional structures, they don't get real chances to improve their critical thinking, interact with social concerns, or internalize democratic and inclusive civic values.

Civic education runs the danger of becoming symbolic and useless if it lacks participatory, reflective, and action-oriented teaching, failing to contribute to the development of informed, engaged, and socially responsible citizens. Beginning with textbook reform, teacher training, and curriculum redesign, civic education must be rethought, reorganized, and revitalized for Pakistan to advance as a democratic, pluralistic, and socially just society.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

A number of recommendations are made to enhance the textbook's civic instructional value in light of the results and discussion. By including actual case studies on subjects like minority rights, social inequality, governance difficulties, and environmental concerns, the textbook should first integrate inquiry-based and participatory learning opportunities. In addition to these, there needs to be community-based projects, debates, mock elections, group discussions, and exercises involving ethical dilemmas that encourage students to participate actively rather than passively. Second, chapters should include value-oriented and reflective activities that encourage students to consider the civic and ethical ramifications of current and historical events. To promote civic ideals and values, themes like tolerance, justice, human rights, diversity, and social responsibility need to be particularly emphasized. Thirdly,

by incorporating the perspectives of ethnic, religious, linguistic, and gender minorities, the material must reflect the social diversity of Pakistan. Pluralistic representation like this can promote empathy, social inclusion, and a more comprehensive grasp of national identity.

Furthermore, investment in teacher training and pedagogical support is necessary to improve civic education. Teachers ought to be trained in inclusive teaching methods, project-based learning, and discussion facilitation, with the textbook accompanied by comprehensive instructor guides. Another important proposition is to set aside specific curriculum time for civic education, so that the growth of civic knowledge, abilities, and values is a purposeful component of education rather than an unintended consequence. Civic education should preferably be introduced as a separate or well-defined course in the curriculum. Textbooks must also be constantly reviewed and updated in order to reflect current social and global concerns, such as discussions about human rights, changes in governance, environmental sustainability, and global citizenship, if they are to remain relevant. Lastly, future research is required to concentrate on classroom-based empirical investigations to see how modified and engaging textbooks impact students' civic attitudes and conduct. Longitudinal tracking, interviews, surveys, classroom observations, and other techniques can offer more in-depth knowledge about how civic instruction affects students' democratic participation and engagement.

### **SUMMARY**

The Sindh Textbook Board's XII grade Pakistan Studies textbook was analyzed in this study to see if it successfully promotes civic awareness in students by teaching them civic knowledge, skills, and values. All chapters, assignments, and representations in the book were reviewed using qualitative content analysis and a Citizens Education Framework (Knowledge-Skills-Values model). The textbook, according to the results, provides a comprehensive foundation in civic knowledge, encompassing topics like national identity, state institutions, constitutional history, and historical narratives, but it fails to effectively cultivate civic values and abilities. The majority of the assignments are rote-based with recall questions; there are few interactive activities, discussions, simulations, or reflective exercises. There is little representation of social diversity, minority viewpoints, or current social concerns. The textbook focuses on factual memorization over active citizenship, critical thinking, or community involvement. The study proposes systematic textbook change, the integration of inquiry-based and participatory learning, teacher training, curriculum revision, and ongoing updates to ensure that civic education is in line with democratic, pluralistic, and modern societal demands. Civic education in Pakistan would run the risk of becoming symbolic and ineffective, failing to equip students for active, knowledgeable citizenship in a complex society, unless such changes were made.

### **REFERENCES**

- Ahmed, S., & Hussain, R. (2024). *Re-envisioning civic education in Pakistan: Textbook evaluation and pedagogical challenges*. *Journal of Education and Society*, 12(2), 47–63.
- Aslam, M. (2025). CIVIC EDUCATION AND DEMOCRATIC VALUES IN SCHOOLS. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Management Research*, 3(1), 18-26.
- Bukhari, H., Iqbal, F., & Shahzad, M. (2024). *Content analysis of secondary-level social studies textbooks in Pakistan: Civic knowledge and participation*. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 15(1), 88–105.
- Bukhari, S. R. H., Khan, H. A., Khan, A. U., Haq, I. U., & Hussian, E. (2024). Political Education and Civic Engagement in Pakistan: A Critical Analysis of Curriculum, Pedagogy, and Youth Participation. *Qlantic Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 5(4), 234–247.
- Damiani, V., & Fraillon, J. (2025). Civic and citizenship education, global citizenship education, and education for sustainable development: an analysis of their integrated conceptualization and

- measurement in the international civic and citizenship education study (ICCS) 2016 and 2022. *Large-scale Assessments in Education*, 13(1), 1-28.
- Elo, S., & Kyngäs, H. (2025). *The qualitative content analysis process*. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 81(4), 47–59.
- Fakhar-Ul-Zaman & Hisham-Ul-Hassan. (2023). Fostering Global Citizenship: A Qualitative Study on Civic Education for Pakistani Students on the Palestine–Israel Conflict Through Innovative Pedagogical Approaches. *International Research Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 4(4), 217–234.
- Galston, W. A. (2001). *Political knowledge, political engagement, and civic education*. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 4, 217–234.
- Habiba, U., Shahzad, S., Ghaffar, A., & Sohail, M. (2025). Content Analysis of 9th Grade Pakistan Studies Curriculum for Social Cohesion. *Journal of Social Horizons*, 2(2), 328–333.
- Hsieh, H.-F., & Shannon, S. E. (2005). *Three approaches to qualitative content analysis*. *Qualitative Health Research*, 15(9), 1277–1288.
- Iqbal, S., Mahmood, R., & Shahzad, A. (2024). *Textbook evaluation and civic learning in Pakistan: A content analysis approach*. *Pakistan Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 9(2), 31–50.
- Kahne, J., & Westheimer, J. (2025). *Teaching democracy: What schools need to do*. *Harvard Education Review*, 95(1), 23–48.
- Krippendorff, K. (2018). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology* (4th ed.). Sage Publications.
- Munir, R., & Zaidi, F. (2025). *Evaluating civic competencies in secondary-level textbooks in South Asia: Knowledge, skills, and values*. *Asian Journal of Educational Research*, 13(1), 11–32.
- Quigley, C. N., & Bahmueller, C. F. (1991). *Civitas: A framework for civic education*. Center for Civic Education. Schreier, M. (2023). *Qualitative content analysis in practice* (2nd ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Sindh Textbook Board. (2024). *XII Pakistan Studies textbook* (2024–25 edition). Government of Sindh, Karachi.
- Siow, J. (2025). Does Civic Education Improve Ethnic Tolerance?.
- Taseer, F., Ali, H., & Qureshi, S. (2023). *Civic education in Pakistan: A textbook content analysis approach*. *Ilkogretim Online*, 22(3), 1145–1165.
- Taseer, N. A., Sattar, A., & Siddique, A. (2023). An examination of civic education in Social Studies' textbook at primary school level in Punjab. *Elementary Education Online*, 19(3), 2290–2301
- Torres, C. A., & Bosio, E. (2025). Global citizenship education as a planetary ethics: Embracing humans and non-humans in the pursuit of global solidarity: CA Torres and E. Bosio. *Prospects*, 55(1), 31-49.